



Council of the European Union  
General Secretariat

**Brussels, 29 January 2020**

**WK 13664/2019 INIT**

**LIMITE**

**RECH**

**WORKING PAPER**

*This is a paper intended for a specific community of recipients. Handling and further distribution are under the sole responsibility of community members.*

**WORKING DOCUMENT**

---

From:	General Secretariat of the Council
To:	ERAC Standing Working Group on Gender in Research and Innovation
Subject:	Summary conclusions of the 5th meeting of the ERAC SWG GRI, held on 25 October in Helsinki

---

Delegations will find attached the Summary conclusions of the 5th meeting of the ERAC SWG on Gender in Research and Innovation, held on 25 October 2019 in Helsinki, as approved by written procedure.

**ERAC STANDING WORKING GROUP  
ON GENDER IN RESEARCH AND INNOVATION**

**Summary conclusions**

- Meeting:** 25 October 2019
- Chair:** Marcela LINKOVA
- Secretariat:** Martina Fucimanova, Czech Republic  
Suvi Borsos, Finland
- Present<sup>1</sup>:** Austria, Belgium, Czech Republic, Denmark, European Commission, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Iceland, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Malta, Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey (22)
- Guest:** Ines Berkadija, Croatia

**1. Welcome and adoption of the agenda**

The Chair welcomed the new member (EE) and guests (Croatia). The agenda was adopted.

The Chair congratulated Matti Kajaste and his colleagues for organizing a very important and timely FI PRES conference, and expressed appreciation of the Helsinki call for action. The Chair also thanked FI PRES for kindly hosting the SWG GRI meeting.

**2. Update by the Chair**

a. Summary from latest meetings of ERAC and ERAC Steering Board

Jacqueline Grech (MT) updated the group on the last ERAC Plenary of 2 October where she represented SWG GRI (see PowerPoint Presentation WK 12084/2019). The most important points of update were the state of play of the Ad hoc Working Group on the Future of ERA and the Report on the implementation of ERA National Action Plans and Strategies.

b. Contribution of SWG GRI to the ERAC Ad-hoc Working Group on the future ERA

The Chair summarised the input to date from SWG GRI to the Ad hoc WG, and handed the debate to the Vice-Chair. An overview of countries and their input to the consultation was recapped. The written input from delegations noted the insufficient attention paid to gender equality issues in the draft documents, and this was seconded at the meeting. The delegations

---

<sup>1</sup> The list of delegations present at the meeting is based on the List of Participants that was circulated during the meeting for completion by delegates.

discussed the concept of lighthouses as opposed to priorities and how to approach the reaction to the consultation.

**Discussion points:**

- Focus on how to make the concept of lighthouses work for SWG GRI, recommend a lighthouse on talent and Europe as the place to go for research
- Promote a broader notion of Priority 2 inclusiveness, including gender; intersectional perspective, SDGs and Agenda 2030 to be stressed
- Unpack and rephrase gender issues in the concepts used in the document, such as societal needs, inclusiveness and intersectionality
- Invite the Ad hoc WG to include a preamble spelling out value orientations of ERA, including gender equality as a cross-cutting issue

**Decisions:**

- Response to be drafted by Chair and Vice-Chair for the Ad hoc WG, with additional input for national engagement; a reference is to be made to the Helsinki Call for Action. The response shall not be limited only to the questions asked. SWG GRI shall request an addition of the preamble.

**Tasks for delegations:**

- SWG GRI members to liaise with their national members of the Ad hoc WG and ERAC delegates to drive the message on insufficient attention to gender equality.
- Matti Kajaste (FI) shall explore whether the FI PRES can play a role in addressing this issue.

c. Overview of work achieved/ahead in line with the Work Programme 2019-2020

The Chair presented the work carried out in line with the WP 2019-2020, and noted that work was on track.

- policy brief on gender and innovation drafted and delivered
- subgroup on sexual harassment in academia set up and working
- cooperation with ERA-related groups – will be reported and discussed under ERAC Action plan
- follow up to the guidance on gender balance in decision making – takes place later today
- regular reports to ERAC and ERAC SB, input for meetings and ERAC Annual Report
- contribution to the Ad hoc group on ERA
- contribution to the FI PRES conference New Pathways
- MLW – pay gap

d. Update on the report on the implementation of National Action Plans and Strategies

The Chair updated SWG GRI on the report and SWG GRI's contribution to it.

### 3. Information from EU Presidencies (current and future)

**Matti Kajaste** (FI) acknowledged the importance of the conference for FI PRES and the Helsinki Call for Action and stressed the need of its wide-ranging dissemination.

**Ines Berkadija** (CR) presented the priority of Brain Circulation for the Croatian presidency of the EU (see PowerPoint Presentation). Delegations expressed appreciation of the topics and stressed the relevance of gender to all the issues addressed. Several delegations proposed to reconsider the term brain circulation (and use for example talent circulation instead).

**Christina Haddula- Kuhlmann** (DE) informed SWG GRI about a conference to be held on 11-13 Nov 2020 in Hamburg on gender equality and the intention to host SWG GRI meeting back to back with the conference.

### 4. Update from the Commission – Mina Stareva

Mina Stareva, Head of Gender Sector, provided an update on two points:

- New Commission

The new Commission President is a woman for the first time in history and is committed to gender equality. There will be an Equality Commissioner (MT) and equality will be addressed in an intersectional perspective. Maria Gabriel will be responsible for a large portfolio including R&I, and is strongly committed to gender equality.

- Horizon Europe

A full report on the consultation will be sent to SWG GRI : [https://ec.europa.eu/info/files/co-design-towards-first-strategic-plan-horizon-europe\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/info/files/co-design-towards-first-strategic-plan-horizon-europe_en). Both the consultations on the co-design of Horizon Europe and on the implementation of Horizon Europe, including evidence-based papers received, will feed the discussions with Member States on the implementation modalities of the programme.

The FI PRES conference provided important input.

- 25 November – NCP information day on the last round of Horizon 2020 Swafs calls

Discussion points:

- Inclusion of R&I in the large portfolio of Youth and Innovation
- Publication of the Gendered Innovations II input online – report and recommendations together with case studies will be published on the Commission website, trainings to evaluators will be developed
- The reflection of GENDERACTION recommendations in the Horizon Europe text
- Further action related to Horizon Europe is possible at national level through the Shadow Programme Committee (there will be a meeting in December)

## **5. Implementation of the ERA Action Plan: SWG GRI related actions**

### **a. Overview and state of play**

The Chair informed SWG GRI that written input was submitted to the Helpdesk covering the first half of 2019 on 18/7/2019.

### **b. Cooperation with other ERA-related groups**

The Chair informed SWG GRI of the following exchanges:

- ESFRI: SWG GRI chair met with ESFRI chair on 20<sup>th</sup> August to discuss the potential areas of cooperation and to plan concrete steps. The chairs agreed that SWG GRI chair would be consulted on the planned ESFRI Guidelines on the update of the ESFRI Roadmap 2021. The chairs have also agreed that SWG GRI chair would participate in the ESFRI meeting in December in Brussels, with a presentation on relevant gender topics, as a preparatory ground for potential further exchanges.
- GPC: The ES delegate in the SWG GRI participated in a meeting of GPC on 20 September to present the activities of SWG GRI and discuss potential areas of cooperation. A GENDERACTION potential training is being discussed for GPC.
- SFIC: SWG GRI and SFIC are in contact to follow-up on the joint report produced in 2018; a follow-up survey is being conducted by the GENDERACTION project to assess changes in policy implementation regarding gender in international cooperation in STI since 2017, and the two groups have been invited to contribute to the survey. The extended deadline for survey completion is 30 October 2019. Delegations are particularly requested to complete the last three questions on developments since 2017.
- SWG HRM: under discussion is an invitation of the subgroup representative to present preliminary findings on sexual harassment at the next SWG HRM meeting – to be decided and SWG HRM chair to be approached. It could be discussed whether this the report and recommendations could be delivered as joint report and recommendations from SWG GRI and HRM.

The Chair thanked delegations for providing input regarding cooperation with other ERA-related groups which show differences in how interactions are organized at MS level among the ERA-related groups and ERAC delegates.

#### **Discussion points:**

- CZ requested that the input for ESFRI be shared with SWG GRI as this may be useful for national level negotiations

c. Possible revision of the SWG GRI mandate

The Chair summarized the written input from delegations:

- Several delegations noted that this was ill timed due to the ongoing revision of ERA; there is an expectation that mandate will need to be revised in the future.
- Several delegations highlighted the need to address intersectionality.
- Other issues: visibility and website, meeting premises to be provided by the Council

**Discussion points:**

- Invisibility of the SWG GRI output and the need to have one place with all outputs of the group: the AT ERA portal was appreciated; delegations agreed that links to all SWG GRI outputs at the Council register of documents shall be provided in the Strategic Policy Advice section of the GENDERACTION website, link to this at the KiF Committee website (NO)
- Delegations in principle agreed to have meetings outside Brussels under Presidencies of the EU

d. Communication and dissemination of SWG GRI outputs

The Chair summarized the written input from delegations:

- Limited reach to other stakeholders than ministry colleagues or other ERA-related groups
- Limited contact with RFOs and RPOs and women's organizations

**Discussion points:**

- Limits / issues that prevent dissemination, how to improve targeted dissemination
  - o The documents can be sometimes quite technical and may not be understandable, a glossary of terms could be useful
  - o Accompany publication of documents with accessible cover letter summarizing the main messages and recommendations
  - o Use of a Twitter account for SWG GRI – this was discussed at ERAC SB and is not possible
  - o SWG GRI produces a lot out resources but they are not easily accessible in one place
  - o Prepare bi-annual summaries of work done with links and accessible description
  - o Targeted circulation to relevant stakeholders
  - o Use relevant venues at national level to disseminate

**Decisions:**

- The Chair to agree a procedure with the Secretariat on how to accompany publication of adopted documents with a cover letter
- The Chair and Vice-Chair to prepare bi-annual summaries of work achieved by SWG GRI with links to the documents

**Tasks for delegations:**

- Target circulation to relevant stakeholders in a targeted manner
- Use national venues and opportunities for targeted dissemination

e. Volume and content of meeting documents and how to improve timely distribution  
The Chair summarized the written input from delegations:

- a. Volume can be heavy, it is important to indicate priorities
- b. Ensure 15 days to comment
- c. Written input from commission prior to meeting

**Discussion points:**

- It may be hard to match documents with (sub) items of agenda
- Request that the Commission provide an update in writing prior to the meeting
- It can sometimes be hard to keep track of all tasks and input requests communicated by email
- Gentle reminders are useful; the Chair explained the “gentle reminder” procedure used (first a gentle reminder prior to deadline, secondly a reminder past deadline with a list of countries that have submitted input timely). The Chair might send a third a targeted personalised communication with delegations on important points where contribution is necessary, but relies on delegations' responsibility to contribute timely.

**Decisions:**

- Documents circulated for meeting to be linked by number to agenda point for clarity
- The Chair to share her tracking system for inspiration

**6. Sub-group on sexual harassment and sexual assault in academia, with a focus on international mobility**

The Rapporteur introduced the work. Maja Lundquist presented preliminary analysis and issues to be addressed in the analysis (see PowerPoint presentation WK 12084/2019).

**Discussion points:**

- Clarification of procedure regarding interpretation of answers from delegations – this is analytical input done by the SE team
- Science diplomacy issues related to sending students and researchers to unsafe regions with high levels of rape and sexual violence against women while wishing to maintain exchange programmes (China, India, Muslim countries)
- How will efficacy of proposed recommendations be measured? Recommendations will be first developed by the sub-group and presented to SWG GRI for discussion.
- EC will provide an answer to the questionnaire; request to always put the Head of Sector in copy of communication with Commission.
- Issue of language: different understandings of gender based violence; the mandate talks about harassment and assault; delegations affirmed the importance of using sexual harassment for the sake of understanding by non-expert stakeholders.

## **7. Follow-up to Guidance to facilitate the implementation of targets to promote gender equality in research and innovation: Assessment of implementation**

The Chair presented a preliminary overview of the state of implementation at national level and opened discussion regarding steps forward. Several delegations pointed their missing input which will be integrated in the overview after the meeting.

### **Discussion points:**

- How to move this task forward

### **Decisions**

- The Excel spreadsheet will be circulated for final fact checking and updates.
- A document will be drafted by March 2020 stating that analysis has been performed and presenting examples showcasing female targets and quotas are effective.

### **Tasks for delegations:**

- Delegations to identify themselves to the Chair if concrete measures have been adopted in response to the Guidance
- Delegations to think about examples of good practice from national level where targets and quotas have been effective
- Delegations to think about case studies/recommendations to be presented

## **8. Sub-group on gender and digitalization: the way forward**

The Chair recapped the countries that have signed up for the work on the topics (DE, ES, IL, LU, PT) and thanked PT for preparing a background note.

### **Discussion:**

- The focus of the work should be broader than discussed in the background note
- The need to focus on issues relevant to research and innovation
- Work could address all 3 ERA objectives for gender equality
- Cooperation with Gendered Innovations II expert group of the Commission (<https://ec.europa.eu/digital-single-market/en/european-network-women-digital>)
- Address the recommendations of the High Level Expert Group on Ethics and AI and how to build on recommendations they delivered in terms of gender
- All to send input/ideas what the group should tackle
- The scope can range from a sub-group or exchange of views to a mutual learning exchange with an external expert invited

### **Decisions:**

- A task force has been formed from the countries that have signed up for this exercise

- The task force needs to identify among themselves a leader, a person to take a lead to identify herself by 15-20<sup>th</sup> November to the Chair
- Delegations are invited to sign up to the task force
- By 15<sup>th</sup> January the task force will propose the scope of the work on gender and digitalization to be performed by the SWG GRI, to be agreed by SWG GRI

## **9. Mutual learning exercise**

Barbara Hartung (DE) presented a study of the Gender Pay Gap in Lower Saxony universities (see Power Point presentation WK 12084/2019).

Aliza Forman Rabinovici (IL) presented a study of the Gender Pay Gap in Israeli academia (see Power Point presentation WK 12084/2019).

### **Discussion points:**

- DE and IL are asked to circulate the reports if available in English
- For the future delegations are requested to focus not only on the factual findings and results but also on the process of data collections, potential obstacles faced and the methodology used.

## **10. Updates from Member States**

Marissa Herder (NL) presented the outcomes of the recent Gender Summit organized in Amsterdam and the plan for action at national level in response (see Power Point presentation WK 12084/2019).

Gemma Irvine (IE) presented the Higher Education Authority Centre of Excellence for Gender Equality (see Power Point presentation WK 12084/2019).

## **11. Update from H2020 GENDERACTION**

The Chair mentioned the upcoming opportunities for cooperation for SWG GRI members with GENDERACTION and invited members to identify themselves for potential Mutual learning exercises. For further details, see Power Point presentation WK 12084/2019.

## **12. Any other business**

The next meeting of the SWG GRI will take place in Brussels in April 2020. Date will be found together with AT.